EXHIBIT 43

NYCDOT CSFF Franchise RFP Scoring Guidelines Pin #:84104MBAD689

NYCDOT COORDINATED STREET FURNITURE FRANCHISE RFP SCORING SHEET GUIDELINES FOR COMMITTEE MEMBERS

PHASE ONE (Responsiveness Determination) (Pass/Fail)

The Auditor General of DOT will review all proposals to determine if they are responsive to the minimum requirements of the RFP. This is not a substantive review; every proposer who submits all required information, plans, data, etc., will go on to Phase Two.

EXHIBIT

(21/3 37

61/0108 1

PHASE TWO -- Ability to Provide Required Services (Maximum 25 points)

COORDINATED STREE	IFUR	NIIUF	CE FRANCHISE RFP SCORING TALL	Y SHEET			
EVALUATOR:			DATE:				
PROPOSER:							
							
Phase Two - Ability to Provide Required Services (25 points) Each proposal receiving a score of 15 or better shall advance to the next phase of evaluation. In the event that the total number of proposals achieving a score of 15 is less than three, the next highest proposals will be added in rank order to achieve a minimum pool of three proposals advancing to the next phase. References may be used by evaluators to help determine scores in this phase.							
A: Business Organization & Financial Fitness (13 points)		B: Past Performance & Experience with Street Furniture In Urban Environments (12 points)					
A1. Adequate access to capital and operating funds by franchisee (and subcontractors, if applicable)	8		B1. BSSs (installation, maintenance, operation, program administration)	3			
A2. Ability of franchisee to maintain books and records (and subcontractors, if applicable)	2		B2. APTs (installation, maintenance, operation, program administration)	2			
A3. Staff resumes & corporate organization of franchisee (and subcontractors, if applicable)	3		B3. NSs (installation, maintenance, operation, program administration)	3			
			B4. Advertising record	4			
Subtotal for A	***************************************		Subtotal for B				
			Phone Torre Torrel		7		

This phase of review will evaluate each responsive proposer's business organization, financial fitness, and past experience with street furniture in urban environments. Each proposal receiving a score of 15 or better shall advance to the next phase of evaluation. In the event that the total number of proposals achieving a score of 15 is less than three, the next highest proposals will be added in rank order to achieve a minimum pool of three proposals advancing to the next phase. Categories A and B below comprise Phase Two review. References may be used by evaluators to help determine scores in this phase.

Category A: Business Organization & Financial Fitness (13 points)

A1. Adequate Access to Capital and Operating Funds by Franchisee (and Subcontractors, if applicable) (8)

The proposer's business organization and financial soundness, including without limitation, adequate access to sources of capital and operating funds. The proposer must show this by the presentation of financial statements, annual reports, or other verifiable means.

A2. Ability of Franchisee to Maintain Books & Records (and Subcontractors, if applicable)
(2)

The proposer's ability to produce and maintain all types of standard and customized books and records. These should include, but are not limited to, financial, budget, invoice, billing, revenue, cost analysis, personnel, operating, maintenance tracking.

A3. Staff Resumes & Corporate Organization of Franchisee (and Subcontractors, if applicable) (3)

Evaluate personnel who will be directly involved in managing the franchise. Evaluate personnel who will be directly involved in providing technical support (financial, legal, computer, etc.) for the franchise. Evaluate personnel who will be directly involved with performing any required field work (installation, maintenance, etc.) to support the franchise. Evaluate personnel who will be directly involved with selling advertising space for the franchise. Evaluate the proposer's organizational structure. The evaluation criteria include, but are not limited to, organizational charts, specific job descriptions, and resumes.

Category B: Past Performance & Experience with Street Furniture in Urban Environments (12 points)

- B1. Bus Stop Shelters (design, installation, operation, and maintenance)

 Demonstrate a proven ability to install and/or remove Bus Stop Shelters within a set period of time (looks to construction aspects of Bus Stop Shelters). Demonstrate a proven ability to maintain and respond to problems with a large number of Bus Stop Shelters within a specific period of time. Demonstrate a proven ability to design, or obtain a Bus Stop Shelter design or designs, acceptable to the jurisdiction in which the Bus Stop Shelters are located and to provide the actual structures to the jurisdiction in a form and manner acceptable to the jurisdiction. Demonstrate a proven ability to operate a Bus Stop Shelter program in an urban environment pursuant to parameters similar to those required by the RFP (includes oversight and management of subcontractors and overall program coordination).
- B2. Automatic Public Toilets (design, installation, operation, and maintenance) (2)
 Demonstrate a proven ability to install and/or remove Automatic Public Toilets within a set period of time (looks to construction aspects of Automatic Public Toilets).
 Demonstrate a proven ability to maintain and respond to problems with a similar number of Automatic Public Toilets within a specific period of time. Demonstrate a proven ability to design, or obtain an Automatic Public Toilet design or designs, acceptable to the jurisdiction in which the Automatic Public Toilets are located. Demonstrate a proven ability to operate an Automatic Public Toilet program in a major urban environment pursuant to parameters similar to those required by the RFP (includes oversight and management of subcontractors and overall program coordination).
- B3. Newsstands (design, installation, operation, and maintenance)

Demonstrate a proven ability to install and/or remove Newsstands within a set period of time (looks to construction aspects of Newsstands). Demonstrate a proven ability to maintain and respond to problems with a similar number of Newsstands within a specific period of time. Demonstrate a proven ability to design, or obtain a Newsstand design or designs, acceptable to the jurisdiction in which the Newsstands are located. Demonstrate a proven ability to operate a Newsstand program in a major urban environment pursuant to parameters similar to those required by the RFP (includes oversight and management of subcontractors and overall program coordination).

B4. Advertising Record (4)

The proposer's experience in the sale and maintenance of outdoor advertisements in an urban environment. The proposer must show an ability to sell and maintain advertising space, to keep advertisers over a period of time, and to maximize revenues from available space. This can be demonstrated by a joint venture proposal with an established advertising agency, present involvement with outdoor advertising, or firm commitments from advertisers to buy space. The goal of this criterion is to evaluate the proposer's demonstrated ability with prior projects.

<u>PHASE THREE - Technical Merit</u> (Maximum 60 points, plus 4 preference points)

COORDINATED STREET FURNITURE FR	ANCHISE RFP - SCORING TALLY SHEET
EVALUATOR:	DATE:
PROPOSER:	

7 2000 7	uree - recunical Merit (ou	point	s) (Plus 4 Preference Points)		
C: Marketing Plan (5 points)	D: Design Pla (30 points)	n	E: Maintenance & Adminis Plan (25 points)	· —	
C1. Proposed plan 3	D1. Citywide design scheme aesthetics	6	E1. Plan for BSS manufacture, installation, maintenance, and operation	3	
2. Plan 2 ustomized to meet eighborhood eeds	D2. Citywide design scheme adaptability to design contexts	3	E2. Plan for APT manufacture, installation, maintenance, and operation	3	
	D3. BSS design and materials (function, sizes, aesthetics)	6	E3. Plan for NS manufacture, installation, maintenance, and operation	3	
	D4. NS design and materials (function, sizes, aesthetics)	6	E4. Administration plan, including staffing and allocation of resources	4	
	D5. APT design and materials (function, sizes, aesthetics)	6	E5. Build-out schedule	3	
	D6. PSS design and materials (function, sizes, aesthetics)	3	E6. Ability to maintain the property of the City	3	
			E7. Proposed computer system	2	
			E8. Commitments to improve design, technology, and/or services	2	
			E9. Plan for PSS manufacture, installation, maintenance, and operation	2	
Subtotal for C Subtotal for D		Subtotal For E			
reference Points Ianufactured and assemble	ed in USA, not wholly in NY	C (incl	Phase Three Subtonudes USA/NYC) (2)	tal	
Ianufactured and assemble	ed wholly in NYC (2)				
-	and the state of t		Preference Points Subtot	al	

NOTE: Additional factors to be considered in determining scores are references (with particular importance to those from other government entities), presentations by proposers (if required), and interviews with proposers on all facets of their proposal submissions (if required).

There are three scoring categories, each represented in a column. The maximum number of points that can be scored in each category is noted in each category column; the highest total score that can be given to a proposer by each evaluator is 60 points, plus 4 preference points, if applicable.

Each category consists of elements that are to be rated. The highest score for each element is represented by the number in parentheses next to the description of the element. All proposals must meet the mandatory RFP requirements; a score of one (1) point is given for satisfying the minimum RFP requirements. Elements that are enhancements to the RFP requirements should be scored according to the evaluator's judgment of the proposal's merits. Categories C, D, and E below comprise Phase Three review.

Category C: Marketing Plan (5)

- C1. Proposed Plan

 The proposer's plan for marketing the franchise structures and the advertising on the structures. All plans, whether for new street furniture or retrofits, must meet the minimum standard as set forth in the RFP. If a proposal is submitted that is an improvement on the present requirements, points may be awarded.
- C2. <u>Plan Customized to Meet Neighborhood Needs</u> (2)

 The proposer's consideration of borough and neighborhood needs and the consideration of both local and national advertisers.

Category D: Design Plan (30)

- D1. Citywide Design Scheme -- Aesthetics (6)
 The design of the franchise structures, including functional efficiency, aesthetics, security, durability, adaptability for various built environments around the City, and accommodation for people with disabilities.
- D2. <u>Citywide Design Scheme -- Adaptability to Design Contexts</u> (3)

 The design of the franchise structures, including functional efficiency, aesthetics, security, durability, adaptability for various built environments around the City, and accommodation for people with disabilities.
- D3. BSS Design and Materials (6)
 The design of the Bus Stop Shelters, including functional efficiency, aesthetics, security, durability, adaptability for various built environments around the City, and accommodation for people with disabilities.
- D4. NS Design and Materials (6)

The design of the Newsstands, including functional efficiency, aesthetics, security, durability, adaptability for various built environments around the City, and accommodation for people with disabilities.

- D5. APT Design and Materials (6)
 The design of the Automatic Public Toilets, including functional efficiency, aesthetics, security, durability, adaptability for various built environments around the City, and accommodation for people with disabilities.
- D6. PSS Design and Materials (3)
 The design of the PSSs, including functional efficiency, aesthetics, security, durability, adaptability for various built environments around the City, and accommodation for people with disabilities.

Category E: Maintenance & Administration Plan (25)

- E1. Plans for BSS Manufacture, Installation, Maintenance, and Operation (3)
 The proposer's plan for installing, maintaining, and operating the BSSs. All proposals must meet the minimum maintenance standards as set forth in the RFP; any proposal that provides for additional maintenance features such as, weekly inspections in addition to the two that are required, annual painting, or improved response time may be awarded points.
- E2. Plans for APT Manufacture, Installation, Maintenance, and Operation (3)
 The proposer's plan for installing, maintaining, and operating the APTs. All proposals must meet the minimum maintenance standards as set forth in the RFP. Any proposal that provides for additional maintenance features such as, inspections more than once a day, annual painting, or improved response time may be awarded points.
- Plans for NS Manufacture, Installation, Maintenance, and Operation (3)

 The proposer's plan for installing, maintaining, and operating the NSs, including proposed time limits for the construction, replacement and relocation of NSs. All proposals must meet the minimum maintenance standards as set forth in the RFP. Any proposal that provides for additional maintenance features such as, weekly inspections in addition to the two that are required, annual painting, or improved response time may be awarded points.
- E4. Administration Plan, including Staffing and Allocation of Resources (4)
 Proposers must demonstrate how their resources will be allocated (i.e., staff, materials, equipment, administrative overhead, etc.) to provide each element of the Scope of Services described in Section II of the RFP.
- E5. Proposed Build-Out Schedule (3)
- E6. Ability to Maintain the Property of the City (3)
- E7. Proposed Computer System (2)

- E8. Commitments to Improve Design, Technology, and/or Services (2)
- E9. Plans for PSS Manufacture, Installation, Maintenance, and Operation (2)
 The proposer's plan for installing, maintaining, and operating the PSSs. All proposals must meet the minimum maintenance standards as set forth in the RFP. Any proposal that provides for additional maintenance features, such as weekly inspections in addition to the two that are required, annual painting, or improved response time may be awarded points.

Preference Points may be awarded for the following categories:

Manufactured and assembled in USA, not in NYC (2)
Manufactured and assembled in NYC (2)

PHASE FOUR -- Compensation to the City (Maximum 55 points) (Plus 1 preference point)

COORDINATED STREET FURNITURE FRANCHISE RFP - S	CODING TALLY OFFE
COORDINATED STREET FORMTORE FRANCHISE RFF - 3	SCORING TALLY SHEET
EVALUATOR:	DATE:
PROPOSER:	<u>.</u>
Phase Four Compensation to the City (55 points)(Plus	l preference point)
Guaranteed Minimum	
Percentage of Advertising Revenue	
Increase or Reduction for PSSs	
Phase Four Subtotal	
Preference Point	
Front loaded compensation package (1)	
Preference Point Subtotal	
Phase Four Total including professors point	

TOTAL SCORE (Maximum 145 points)

COORDINATED STREET FURNITURE FRANCHISE RFP SCORING TALLY S	HEET
EVALUATOR: DATE:	
PROPOSER:	
Total Score (145 points)	
Total Score (143 points)	
Ability to Provide Required Services - Phase Two total	
Technical Merit - Phase Three total (including preference points)	
Compensation to the City - Phase Four total (including preference point)	
TOTAL SCORE	

The Total Score is the sum of the Phase Two score plus the Phase Three technical score (including any PSS points and preference points) plus the Phase Four compensation score (including any preference point). The proposer(s) with the highest total score will be invited to enter into negotiations with the City for the franchise.